



## 2015 RFPs for Recreation Facility LED Supply and Service Provider: Process and Outcome

Local Authority Services (LAS), AMO's not-for-profit organization, helps its customers "save money, make money, and build capacity" through co-operative procurement efforts and innovative training, programs, and services. From 2012-2014, LAS Energy Efficiency Service Providers (EESPs) funded by the Ontario Power Authority, were able to assist municipalities with identifying energy saving opportunities in a number of their facilities. Based on these audits, and through a survey conducted in the fall of 2014, our members expressed strong interest in a recreation facility LED lighting upgrade service.

LED technology offers considerable energy savings, significantly reduced maintenance costs, and a much higher quality light. Given that these facilities are the most frequently visited in most municipalities, upgrading to LED will be an excellent visible energy conservation project to showcase to the community.

The LAS Recreation Facility LED Service is a complete turn-key solution combining top quality product, extended warranties robust photometric design, full installation management, and commissioning services, plus finance options. The service is aimed at assisting municipal and broader public sector agencies in upgrading their high bay lighting in various facilities including arenas, pools, garages, and industrial plants (water/wastewater).

LAS issued two RFPs for this service in January 2015: one for product supply and a second for service provision. LAS was careful to ensure that the RFP met and surpassed municipal procurement standards supporting a transparent and competitive search for suppliers and service providers offering quality products and services at an affordable price while remaining unbiased and open in its wording. A number of Specification Guides, pilot studies, protocols, standards, quotes, and tender documents were utilized to develop both RFPs including the following:

|  |   |
|--|---|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Canadian Standards Association (CSA)</li><li>• American Society for Testing &amp; Measurement (ASTM)</li><li>• Electrical Safety Authority (ESA)</li><li>• Illuminating Engineering Society of North America (IESNA)</li><li>• International Electrotechnical Commission (IEC)</li><li>• Ontario Recreation Facilities Association (ORFA)</li><li>• Design Lights Consortium's Product Qualified Products List (DLC QPL)</li><li>• Public Works &amp; Government Services Canada</li></ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• The Township of North Kawartha</li><li>• The City of Oakville</li><li>• The Township of Wellesley</li><li>• The Town of Orangeville</li><li>• The Town of Quinte West</li><li>• The Municipality of Kincardine</li><li>• The City of Brampton</li><li>• The City of Mississauga</li><li>• The Township of Oliver/Paipoonge</li><li>• RICOH Coliseum</li><li>• Various technical specification sheets and subsequent photometric requirements and designs from major international manufacturers</li></ul> |
|--|---|



Both RFP documents and subsequent submissions were reviewed by an Evaluation Committee comprised of ten (10) experts from across Ontario (including staff from Brampton, Oakville, Timmins, Hearst, North Bay), ORFA, as well as three LAS staff members.

Independent third-party analysis (Welch LLP) was conducted on the financial background of the proponents, and the entire RFP process was overseen by KDE Procurement Advisors.

## **RFP Results for FIXTURE SUPPLY**

The RFP was posted on Merx and the LAS website from JAN 16 to FEB 20, 2015. As a result of the RFP process 15 firms requested full documents and we received five (5) submissions; three (3) full submissions met the Mandatory Submission Requirements, one (1) full submission failed to fulfill the Mandatory Submission Requirements, and one (1) partial submission failed to fulfil any of the Mandatory Submission Requirements.

The committee evaluated those submissions meeting mandatory requirements in two distinct phases based on the following factors:

|  |  |
|--|--|
| <b>Company Experience &amp; Qualifications</b>                 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Ability of the company to produce fixtures and meet goals of the LAS Recreation Facility Lighting program.</li> <li>Ability to support the program and our municipalities moving forward</li> <li>Reference checks to verify experience and performance of the company on past similar projects</li> <li>Experience and longevity of the company</li> </ul> |
| <b>Financial Background</b>                                    | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Comparison of the company financial ratios to industry average over last 5 years</li> <li>Projections for the upcoming fiscal year</li> </ul>   |
| <b>Fixture Quality</b>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Life expectancy ratings &amp;</li> <li>Manufacturing and Quality Control processes</li> <li>Packaging and shipping processes</li> <li>Warranties and after sales service</li> </ul>   |
| <b>Fixture Performance</b>                                     | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Ability to meet more than 20 key specifications and standards from CSA/DLC/ANSI/IESNA/NEMA/FCC/etc.</li> <li>Photometric evaluations for 6 common rink area illuminance level case studies</li> </ul>   |
| <b>Value added components</b>                                  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Extended warranties</li> <li>Fixture innovation &amp; product selections</li> <li>Ability to combine with controls</li> </ul>   |
| <b>Overall Proposal Completeness, Clarity and Organization</b> |  |

Those submissions which met the minimum 70% scoring under the above criteria were then evaluated based on the individual fixture and alternate component price submissions. After a careful and thorough analysis of the submissions, the Evaluation Committee decided to award the supply contract to *Acuity Brands Canada* as they represented the best overall value for product supply to our members.



## **RFP Results for SERVICE PROVIDER**

The RFP was posted on Merx and the LAS website from JAN 16 to FEB 20, 2015. As a result of the RFP process, twelve (12) firms requested full documents. Two (2) submissions fulfilled the Mandatory Submission Requirements.

The committee evaluated those submissions meeting mandatory requirements based on the following factors:

|  |  |
|--|--|
| <b>Company Experience &amp; Qualifications</b>                 | <p>The ability to meet set goals of the LAS Recreation Facility Lighting program.</p> <p>Ability to support the program and our municipalities moving forward</p> <p>Reference checks to verify experience and performance of the company on past similar projects</p> <p>Experience and longevity of the company</p> <p>Demonstrated experience in conducting analysis and project management relevant to an arena lighting upgrade</p> |
| <b>Financial Background</b>                                    | <p>Comparison of the company financial ratios to industry average over last 5 years</p> <p>Projections for the upcoming fiscal year</p>  |
| <b>Full Plan of Execution and Delivery Capacity</b>            | <p>Evaluation of methodology</p> <p>Sample audit report and photometric design</p> <p>Proposed project work plan and schedule</p> <p>Project management execution</p> <p>Project closeout and after sales support</p>  |
| <b>Project Cost</b>  | Quote based on a sample Case Study   |
| <b>Value added components</b>                                  | Exceed the minimum RFP requirements (i.e. Available client services, Financing, support, etc.)   |
| <b>Overall Proposal Completeness, Clarity and Organization</b> |  |

The Evaluation Committee conducted a careful and thorough analysis of the submissions. Both submissions were within an overall point score difference of 1/150, and the committee decided that it would be in our member's best interest to award to both; as they both provided services of great value and resulted in an increased delivery capacity for the program across the Province of Ontario. In spring 2015, LAS partnered with both *I.B. Storey (IBS)* and *Conrad Lighting Solutions (CLS)* to manage the Recreation Facility LED Lighting projects from commencement to completion.

One year later, IBS indicated that they were no longer able to fulfill the terms of their service agreement. The agreement with IBS was subsequently terminated and, based on their excellent performance and the success of the Recreation Facility Lighting Service, CLS assumed the role of Service Provider for the entire Province.